

Lead Testing in School Drinking Water

Effective: December 5, 2016

Pursuant to the authority vested in the Commissioner of Health by Public Health Law sections 1370-a and 1110, Subpart 67-4 of Title 10 (Health) of the Official Compilation of Codes, Rules and Regulations of the State of New York is added, to be effective upon filing with the Secretary of State, to read as follows:

SUBPART 67-4: Lead Testing in School Drinking Water

Section 67-4.1 Purpose.

This Subpart requires all school districts and boards of cooperative educational services, including those already classified as a public water system under 10 NYCRR Subpart 5-1, to test potable water for lead contamination and to develop and implement a lead remediation plan, where applicable.

Section 67-4.2 Definitions.

As used in this Subpart, the following terms shall have the stated meanings:

(a) *Action level* means 15 micrograms per liter ($\mu\text{g/L}$) or parts per billion (ppb). Exceedance of the action level requires a response, as set forth in this Subpart.

(b) *Building* means any structure, facility, addition, or wing of a school that may be occupied by children or students. The terms shall not include any structure, facility, addition, or wing of a school that is lead-free, as defined in section 1417 of the Federal Safe Drinking Water Act.

(c) *Commissioner* means the State Commissioner of Health.

(d) *Department* means the New York State Department of Health.

(e) *Outlet* means a potable water fixture currently or potentially used for drinking or cooking purposes, including but not limited to a bubbler, drinking fountain, or faucets.

(f) *Potable water* means water that meets the requirements of 10 NYCRR Subpart 5-1.

(g) *School* means any school district or board of cooperative educational services (BOCES).

Section 67-4.3 Monitoring.

(a) All schools shall test potable water for lead contamination as required in this Subpart.

(b) First-draw samples shall be collected from all outlets, as defined in this Subpart. A first-draw sample volume shall be 250 milliliters (mL), collected from a cold water outlet before any water is used. The water shall be motionless in the pipes for a minimum of 8 hours, but not more than 18 hours, before sample collection. First-draw samples shall be collected pursuant to such other specifications as the Department may determine appropriate.

(c) Initial first-draw samples.

(1) For existing buildings in service as of the effective date of this regulation, schools shall complete collection of initial first-draw samples according to the following schedule:

(i) for any school serving children in any of the levels prekindergarten through grade five, collection of samples is to be completed by September 30, 2016;

(ii) for any school serving children in any of the levels grades six through twelve that are not also serving students in any of the levels prekindergarten through grade five, and all other applicable buildings, collection of samples is to be completed by October 31, 2016.

(2) For buildings put into service after the effective date of this regulation, initial first-draw samples shall be performed prior to occupancy; provided that if the building is put into service between the effective date of this regulation but before October 31, 2016, the school shall have 30 days to perform first-draw sampling.

(3) Any first-draw sampling conducted consistent with this Subpart that occurred after January 1, 2015 shall satisfy the initial first-draw sampling requirement.

(d) Continued monitoring. Schools shall collect first-draw samples in accordance with subdivision (b) of this section again in 2020 or at an earlier time as determined by the commissioner. Schools shall continue to collect first-draw samples at least every 5 years thereafter or at an earlier time as determined by the commissioner.

(e) All first-draw samples shall be analyzed by a laboratory approved to perform such analyses by the Department's Environmental Laboratory Approval Program (ELAP).

Section 67-4.4 Response.

If the lead concentration of water at an outlet exceeds the action level, the school shall:

(a) prohibit use of the outlet until:

(1) a lead remediation plan is implemented to mitigate the lead level of such outlet; and

(2) test results indicate that the lead levels are at or below the action level;

(b) provide building occupants with an adequate supply of potable water for drinking and cooking until remediation is performed;

(c) report the test results to the local health department as soon as practicable, but no more than 1 business day after the school received the laboratory report; and

(d) notify all staff and all persons in parental relation to students of the test results, in writing, as soon as practicable but no more than 10 business days after the school received the laboratory report; and, for results of tests performed prior to the effective date of this Subpart, within 10 business days of this regulation's effective date, unless such written notification has already occurred.

Section 67-4.5 Public Notification.

(a) List of lead-free buildings. By October 31, 2016, the school shall make available on its website a list of all buildings that are determined to be lead-free, as defined in section 1417 of the Federal Safe Drinking Water Act.

(b) Public notification of testing results and remediation plans.

(1) The school shall make available, on the school's website, the results of all lead testing performed and lead remediation plans implemented pursuant to this Subpart, as soon as practicable, but no more than 6 weeks after the school received the laboratory reports.

(2) For schools that received lead testing results and implemented lead remediation plans in a manner consistent with this Subpart, but prior to the effective date of this Subpart, the school shall make available such information, on the school's website, as soon as practicable, but no more than 6 weeks after the effective date of this Subpart.

Section 67-4.6 Reporting.

(a) As soon as practicable but no later than November 11, 2016, the school shall report to the Department, local health department, and State Education Department, through the Department's designated statewide electronic reporting system:

(1) completion of all required first-draw sampling;

(2) for any outlets that were tested prior to the effective date of this regulation, and for which the school wishes to assert that such testing was in substantial compliance with this Subpart, an attestation that:

(i) the school conducted testing that substantially complied with the testing requirements of this Subpart, consistent with guidance issued by the Department;

(ii) any needed remediation, including re-testing, has been performed;

(iii) the lead level in the potable water of the applicable building(s) is currently below the action level; and

(iv) the school has submitted a waiver request to the local health department, in accordance with Section 67-4.8 of this Subpart; and

(3) a list of all buildings that are determined to be lead-free, as defined in section 1417 of the Federal Safe Drinking Water Act.

(b) As soon as practicable, but no more than 10 business days after the school received the laboratory reports, the school shall report data relating to test results to the Department, local health department, and State Education Department, through the Department's designated statewide electronic reporting system.

Section 67-4.7 Recordkeeping.

The school shall retain all records of test results, lead remediation plans, determinations that a building is lead-free, and waiver requests, for ten years following the creation of such documentation. Copies of such documentation shall be immediately provided to the Department, local health department, or State Education Department, upon request.

Section 67-4.8 Waivers.

(a) A school may apply to the local health department for a waiver from the testing requirements of this Subpart, for a specific school, building, or buildings, by demonstrating in a manner and pursuant to standards determined by the Department, that:

(1) prior to the publication date of these regulations, the school conducted testing that substantially complied with the testing requirements of this Subpart;

(2) any needed remediation, including re-testing, has been performed; and

(3) the lead level in the potable water of the applicable building(s) is currently below the action level.

(b) Local health departments shall review applications for waivers for compliance with the standards determined by the Department. If the local health department recommends approval of the waiver, the local health department shall send its recommendation to the Department, and the Department shall determine whether the waiver shall be issued.

Section 67-4.9 Enforcement.

(a) Upon reasonable notice to the school, an officer or employee of the Department or local health department may enter any building for the purposes of determining compliance with this Subpart.

(b) Where a school does not comply with the requirements of this Subpart, the Department or local health department may take any action authorized by law, including but not limited to assessment of civil penalties as provided by law.

REGULATORY IMPACT STATEMENT

Statutory Authority:

The statutory authorities for the proposed regulation are set forth in Public Health Law (PHL) §§ 1110 and 1370-a. Section 1110 of the PHL directs the Department of Health (Department) to promulgate regulations regarding the testing of potable water provided by school districts and boards of cooperative education services (BOCES) (collectively, “schools”) for lead contamination. Section 1370-a of the PHL authorizes the Department to establish programs and coordinate activities to prevent lead poisoning and to minimize the risk of exposure to lead.

Legislative Objective:

The legislative objective of PHL § 1110 is to protect children by requiring schools to test their potable water systems for lead contamination. Similarly, PHL § 1370-a authorizes the Department to establish programs and coordinate activities to prevent lead poisoning and to minimize the risk of exposure to lead. Consistent with these objectives, this regulation adds a new Subpart 67-4 to Title 10 of the New York Codes, Rules, and Regulations, establishing requirements for schools to test their potable water outlets for lead contamination.

Needs and Benefits:

Lead is a toxic material that is harmful to human health if ingested or inhaled.

Children and pregnant women are at the greatest risk from lead exposure. Scientists have linked lead exposure with lowered IQ and behavior problems in children. It is also possible for lead to

be stored in bones and it can be released into the bloodstream later in life, including during pregnancy. Further, during pregnancy, lead in the mother's bloodstream can cross the placenta, which can result in premature birth and low birth weight, as well as problems with brain, kidney, or nervous system development, and learning and behavior problems. Studies have also shown that low levels of lead can negatively affect adults, leading to heart and kidney problems, as well as high blood pressure and nervous system disorders.

Lead is a common metal found in the environment. The primary source of lead exposure for most children is lead-based paint. However, drinking water is another source of lead exposure due to the lead content of certain plumbing materials and source water.

Laws now limit the amount of lead in new plumbing materials. However, plumbing materials installed prior to 1986 may contain significant amounts of lead. In 1986, the federal government required that only "lead-free" materials be used in new plumbing and plumbing fixtures.

Although this was a vast improvement, the law still allowed certain fixtures with up to 8 percent lead to be labeled as "lead free." In 2011, amendments to the Safe Drinking Water Act appropriately re-defined the definition of "lead-free." Although federal law now appropriately defines "lead-free," some older fixtures can still leach lead into drinking water.

Elevated lead levels are commonly found in the drinking water of school buildings, due to older plumbing and fixtures and intermittent water use patterns. Currently, only schools that have their own public water systems are required to test for lead contamination in drinking water.

In the absence of federal regulations governing all schools, the Department's regulations require all schools to monitor their potable drinking water for lead. The new regulations: establish an action level of 15 micrograms per liter (equivalent to parts per billion, or ppb) for lead in the drinking water of school buildings; establish initial and future monitoring requirements; require schools to develop remedial action plans if the action level is exceeded at any potable water outlet; conduct public notification of results to the school community; and report results to the Department. The Environmental Protection Agency's "3Ts for Reducing Lead in Drinking Water in Schools, Revised Technical Guidance" will be used as a technical reference for implementation of the regulation.

Compliance Costs:

Costs to Private Regulated Parties:

These regulations only applies to public schools. No private schools are affected.

Costs to State Government and Local Government

These regulations applies to schools, which are a form of local government. There are approximately 733 school districts and 37 BOCES in New York State, which include over 5,000 school buildings that will be subject to this regulation.

The regulations require schools to test each potable water outlet for lead, in each school building occupied by children, unless the building is determined to be lead-free pursuant to federal standards. The cost for a single lead analysis ranges from \$20 - \$75 per sample. Initial monitoring requires one sample per outlet. The number of outlets will vary from building to building.

If lead is detected above 15 ppb at any potable water outlet, the outlet must be taken out of service and a remedial action plan must be developed to mitigate the lead contamination, at the school's initial expense. Remediation costs can vary significantly depending on the plumbing configuration and source of lead. The school will also incur minor costs for notification of the school community and local health department, posting the information on their website, and reporting electronically to the Department. Recently enacted legislation authorizes schools to receive State Aid through the State Education Department ("SED") to defray these costs.

Local health departments will also incur some administrative costs related to tracking local implementation, reviewing waiver applications, and compliance oversight. These activities will be eligible for State Aid through the Department's General Public Health Work program.

Local Government Mandates:

Schools, as a form of local government, are required to comply with the regulations, as detailed above.

Paperwork:

The regulation imposes recordkeeping requirements related to: monitoring of potable water outlets; notifications to the public and local health department; and electronic reporting to the Department.

Duplication:

There will be no duplication of existing State or Federal regulations.

Alternatives:

There are no significant alternatives to these regulations, which are being promulgated pursuant to recent legislation.

Federal Standards:

There are no federal statutes or regulations pertaining to this matter. However, the Department's regulations are consistent with the United States Environmental Protection Agency's guidance document titled *3Ts for Reducing Lead in Drinking Water in Schools, Revised Technical Guidance* (available at: https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2015-09/documents/toolkit_leadschools_guide_3ts_leadschools.pdf). EPA's document will serve as guidance to schools for implementing the program.

Compliance Schedule:

For existing buildings put into service as of the effective date of this regulation, all sampling shall be performed according to the following schedule:

- (i) for any school serving children in any of the levels prekindergarten through grade five, collection of samples is to be completed by September 30, 2016;
- (ii) for any school serving children in any of the levels grades six through twelve that are not also serving students in any of the levels prekindergarten through grade five, and all other applicable buildings, collection of samples is to be completed by October 31, 2016.

For buildings put into service after the effective date of this regulation, sampling shall be performed prior to occupancy.

Contact Person:

Katherine Ceroalo
New York State Department of Health
Bureau of House Counsel, Regulatory Affairs Unit
Corning Tower Building, Rm. 2438
Empire State Plaza
Albany, New York 12237
(518) 473-7488
(518) 473-2019 (FAX)
REGSQNA@health.ny.gov

REGULATORY FLEXIBILITY ANALYSIS FOR SMALL BUSINESS AND LOCAL GOVERNMENTS

Effect on Small Business and Local Governments:

This regulation applies to schools, which are a form of local government. As explained in the Regulatory Impact Statement, the new regulations: establish an action level of 15 micrograms per liter (equivalent to parts per billion, or ppb) for lead in the drinking water of school buildings; establish initial and future monitoring requirements; require schools to develop remedial action plans if the action level is exceeded at any potable water outlet; conduct public notification of results to the school community; and report results to the Department. The Environmental Protection Agency's *3Ts for Reducing Lead in Drinking Water in Schools, Revised Technical Guidance* will be used as a technical reference for implementation of the regulation. Local health departments will also incur some administrative costs related to tracking local implementation and oversight of the regulation.

Additionally, the regulations require the services of a laboratory certified by the Department under its Environmental Laboratory Approval Program (ELAP). Some schools may also wish to hire environmental consultants to assist with compliance. Some labs and environmental consultants qualify as small businesses and, at least initially, their services will be in greater demand due to the new regulation.

Compliance Requirements:

As noted above, the new regulations: establish an action level of 15 micrograms per liter (equivalent to parts per billion, or ppb) for lead in the drinking water in school buildings; establish initial and future monitoring requirements; require schools to develop remedial action plans if the action level is exceeded at any potable water outlet; conduct public notification of results to the school community; and requiring reporting of results to the Department.

Reporting and Recordkeeping:

The regulation will impose new monitoring, reporting, and public notification requirements for schools.

Professional Services:

As noted above, the regulations require the services of a laboratory certified by the Department under its Environmental Laboratory Approval Program (ELAP). Some schools may also wish to hire environmental consultants to assist with compliance.

Compliance Costs:

The regulation will require schools to test each potable water outlet for lead, in each school building occupied by children. The cost for a single lead analysis ranges from \$20 - \$75 per sample. Initial monitoring requires one sample per outlet. The number of outlets will vary from building to building.

If lead is detected above 15 ppb at any potable water outlet, the outlet must be taken out of service and a remedial action plan must be developed to mitigate the lead contamination, at the

school's expense. Remediation costs can vary significantly depending on the plumbing configuration and source of lead. The school will also incur minor costs for notification of the school community and local health department, posting the information on their website, and reporting electronically to the Department. Recently enacted legislation authorizes schools to receive State Aid through the State Education Department ("SED") to defray these costs.

Local health departments will also incur some administrative costs related to tracking local implementation, reviewing waiver applications, and compliance oversight. These activities will be eligible for State Aid through the Department's General Public Health Work program.

Cost to Private Parties:

There are no costs to private parties.

Economic and Technological Feasibility:

The technology for lead testing of drinking water is well-established. With respect to schools' costs of compliance, State Aid will be available through the State Education Department to ensure that compliance is feasible. Local health department activities will be eligible for State Aid through the Department's General Public Health Work program.

Minimizing Adverse Impact:

Any school that has already performed testing in compliance with these regulations, as far back as January 1, 2015, does not need to perform sampling again. Further, consistent with the requirements of PHL § 1110, if a school has performed testing that substantially complies with

the regulations, the school may apply to the Department for a waiver, so that additional testing is not required. In either case, the requirement to report sample results, and other requirements, remain in place.

School buildings that are determined to be “lead-free,” as defined in section 1417 of the Federal Safe Drinking Water Act, do not need to test their outlets. School will be required to make available on their website a list of all buildings that are determined to be lead-free.

Small Business and Local Government Participation:

Although small businesses were not consulted on these specific regulations, the dangers of lead in school drinking water has garnered significant local, state, and national attention. The New York State School Board Association (NYSSBA) requested a meeting with the Department to discuss the impacts of the enabling legislation. NYSSBA provided feedback on testing, prior monitoring, and other matters. The Department took this feedback into consideration when drafting the regulation. The Department will also conduct public outreach, and there will be an opportunity to comment on the proposed permanent regulations. The Department will review all public comments received.

RURAL AREA FLEXIBILITY ANALYSIS

Pursuant to Section 202-bb of the State Administrative Procedure Act (SAPA), a rural area flexibility analysis is not required. These provisions apply uniformly throughout New York State, including all rural areas. The proposed rule will not impose an adverse economic impact on rural areas, nor will it impose any disproportionate reporting, recordkeeping or other compliance requirements on the regulated entities in rural areas.

JOB IMPACT STATEMENT

The Department expects there to be a positive impact on jobs or employment opportunities. Some school districts will likely hire firms or individuals to assist with regulatory compliance. Schools impacted by this amendment will require the professional services of a certified laboratory to perform the analyses for lead, which will create a need for additional laboratory capacity.

Categories and Numbers Affected:

The Department anticipates no negative impact on jobs or employment opportunities as a result of the proposed regulations.

Regions of Adverse Impact:

The Department anticipates no negative impact on jobs or employment opportunities in any particular region of the state.

Minimizing Adverse Impact:

Not applicable.

EMERGENCY JUSTIFICATION

Lead exposure is associated with impaired cognitive development in children. The known adverse health effects for children from lead exposure include reduced IQ and attention span, learning disabilities, poor classroom performance, hyperactivity, behavioral problems, and impaired growth. Although measures can be taken to help children overcome any potential impairments on cognition, the effects are considered irreversible.

Lead can enter drinking water from the corrosion of plumbing materials. Facilities such as schools, which have intermittent water use patterns, may have elevated lead concentration due to prolonged water contact with plumbing material. This source is increasingly being recognized as an important relative contribution to a child's overall lead exposure. Recent voluntary testing by school districts in New York State and other jurisdictions demonstrate the need to provide clear direction to schools on the requirements and procedures to sample drinking water for lead.

Every school should supply drinking water to students that meets or exceeds federal and state standards and guidelines. Although the federal Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA") has established a voluntary testing program—known as the "3Ts for Reducing Lead in Drinking Water in Schools"—there is no federal law that requires schools to test their drinking water for lead or that requires an appropriate response, if lead is determined to be present in school drinking water.

To help ensure that children are protected from lead exposure while in school, the Commissioner of Health has determined it necessary to file these regulations on an emergency basis. State Administrative Procedure Act § 202(6) empowers the Commissioner to adopt emergency regulations when necessary for the preservation of the public health, safety or general welfare and that compliance with routine administrative procedures would be contrary to the public interest.

ASSESSMENT OF PUBLIC COMMENT

Public comments were submitted to the New York State Department of Health (Department) on the Emergency Regulation, Subpart 67-4 of Title 10 of the New York State Codes, Rules and Regulations (NYCRR), which requires public schools and boards of cooperative educational services (BOCES) to test all potable water outlets for lead contamination and to take responsive actions to remediate outlets that exceed the lead action level. The Department received comments from two school organizations, one private citizen, and one advocacy organization. These comments and the Department's responses are summarized below.

COMMENT: One commenter requested that the permanent regulation clarify whether the regulation applies only to public schools and BOCES or if charter schools are included in the regulation.

RESPONSE: Consistent with the Department's statutory authority and published guidance, these regulations only apply to public schools districts and BOCES. Charter schools are not required to comply with this regulation, although voluntary compliance with the standards is encouraged. This will be clarified in the permanent regulations.

COMMENT: One commenter requested that the regulation include the US Environmental Protection Agency's sampling procedures for follow-up testing to confirm high lead levels.

RESPONSE: Public Health Law § 1110 directs schools to perform periodic first-draw sampling. First-draw sampling yields meaningful lead test results that are representative of water that is being consumed under normal use conditions, and it establishes a baseline for lead concentrations at all consumptive outlets. Although the regulation does not require second-draw or flush samples, schools may choose to conduct such additional sampling to help identify the source of the elevated lead levels.

COMMENT: One commenter questioned why private schools, daycares, and facilities that house after school programs are not required to comply with this regulation. The commenter also asked why buildings that were once used as school buildings but have since been used for alternative purposes are not included in this regulation.

RESPONSE: Public Health Law § 1110 only applies to public school districts and BOCES. However, the Department encourages voluntary compliance with this regulation for all organizations and facilities that house children, whenever possible.

COMMENT: One commenter suggested that the Department should monitor schools' ability to meet testing deadlines and offer technical assistance if necessary.

RESPONSE: The Department and local health departments conduct regular monitoring of school progress relating to completion of sampling and reporting requirements through compliance check reports. During the initial round of testing completed October 31, the Department published Frequently Asked Questions and other guidance documents, performed

outreach to school districts with the help of local health departments to offer assistance, and conducted multiple webinars to assist school districts in understanding sampling and reporting requirements. The Department's district offices and staff from the local health departments continue follow up directly with those schools, within their jurisdiction, who have not yet completed the compliance requirements. The Department continues to perform outreach activities to facilitate compliance.

COMMENT: One commenter requested that the Department revise the lead action levels, based on information provided by the commenter.

RESPONSE: The Department continues to evaluate risk assessment information on lead in drinking water as more information and research becomes available. However, Public Health Law §1110 specifies that the lead level must be consistent with the standard under federal regulations issued pursuant to the Safe Drinking Water Act, which is also 15 ppb.

COMMENT: One commenter requested that the regulations refrain from using the label of "lead-free" with respect to schools.

RESPONSE: Public Health Law § 1110 establishes use of the term "lead free" and provides that this term will have the same meaning as in section 1417 of the federal safe drinking water act. The Department's use of this term and its meaning are governed by state and federal law, respectively.

COMMENT: One commenter suggested that the Department establish clear standards for testing protocols.

RESPONSE: The Department has published on its website several reference documents to assist the schools with implementation of this regulation. The reference materials include: a video illustrating proper sampling protocols; a quick reference guide for the regulation; a Frequently Asked Questions document; example result notification letter to parents and the school community; example signs to be used during remediation activities; instructions for finding a certified laboratory for testing. These reference materials can be found at http://www.health.ny.gov/environmental/water/drinking/lead/lead_testing_of_school_drinking_water.htm.

COMMENT: One commenter suggested that the Department clarify the type of reporting required in this regulation, by providing information on a searchable database and by interpreting the test results posted on the Department's website.

RESPONSE: The Department is currently verifying the integrity of data in the statewide electronic reporting system. In the near future, the Department intends to provide all reported data to the public via its Health Data NY website. This will allow all stakeholders access to information on lead in school drinking water in real time.

COMMENT: One commenter suggested that the Department should reevaluate the requirement that schools retest every 5 years, and suggested the requirement of systematic spot testing.

RESPONSE: While the regulations establish a *minimum* testing interval of once every five years, the Commissioner retains authority to order additional testing of one or all schools at any time. The Department will consider whether targeted or random testing requirements should be included in the permanent regulation.